Strength in Numbers: The Uses of Comparative Folktale Research

Author(s): Christine Goldberg

Source: *Western Folklore*, Winter 2010, Vol. 69, No. 1 (Winter 2010), pp. 19-34

Published by: Western States Folklore Society

Stable URL: https://www.jstor.org/stable/25735282

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at https://about.jstor.org/terms

Western States Folklore Society is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Western Folklore*

This content downloaded from 79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

Strength in Numbers

The Uses of Comparative Folktale Research

CHRISTINE GOLDBERG

ABSTRACT

The comparative approach that Donald Ward used in his scholarship grew out of comparative philology and has been used in folklore studies for 200 years. Using the concepts of tale type and motif, it permits an investigator to group similar items together and to be very specific about points of similarity and difference. Twelve advantages of the comparative approach are listed along with examples of each.
KEYWORDS: comparative method, history of scholarship, motif, tale type, Ward, Donald

Comparative folktale scholarship is an appropriate subject for this occasion because Donald Ward's research on traditional narratives was made better—and even, I would say, made possible—because the material that he investigated had already been conceptualized in a systematic, orderly manner. First, traditional narrative is classified into genres. Then, within each genre, each different plot is considered to be a type. Finally, each type consists of one or more motifs (Thompson 1955; cf. Ben-Amos 1980:25-30 especially). In practice, this process works better for some genres than for others. For example, legends can be broken down into motifs but they have proven difficult to classify into types. Type classification has been especially successful in the case of folktales (Aarne and Thompson 1961; Uther 2004). The motifs that comprise these tales, along with motifs from myths, legends, ballads, and so on, are listed in the *Motif Index* (Thompson 1955-1958). This hierarchical system enables researchers to conceptualize and discuss narratives, and folktales in particular, as complex forms with constituent components. Relationships

Christine Goldberg is a Library Assistant in the Grace M. Hunt Memorial English Reading Room at UCLA.

Western Folklore 69:1 (Winter 2010):19–34. Copyright © 2010, Western States Folklore Society

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

among complete forms can be specified in terms of the number of the components (that is, the motifs) they share. This system provides scholars with a theoretical orientation and facilitates communication within the scholarly community. It also has a practical effect in that it serves as a basis for comprehensive bibliographic indexes.

Thus, when Don Ward wrote that the motif of the Glass Mountain appears in six particular tale types (ATU [Uther 2004] 303, 400, 425, 451, 550, and 551; *Enzyklopädie des Märchens* [EM], s.v. *Glasberg*), this is meaningful because we know (or can easily learn) what stories those tale type numbers represent, and we can also locate the material necessary to verify that what is claimed is true. When Don wrote about a picture in which serpents surround a man as he plays a harp with his feet, he was able to link this image from Germanic mythology convincingly and efficiently to similar motifs such as Orpheus playing music to charm wild animals, and even to a not-very-funny modern joke (Ward 1972). When Don wanted to compare female fantasies of supernatural lovers to the tale of Beauty and the Beast, he was able to refer to several studies where readers can see for themselves not only the temporal and geographic spread of that tale type but also what stability and what variety there are in this key scene (Ward 1989; see also Mieder 2005).

Nearly twenty years ago, at a memorial service for his colleague and former teacher Wayland Hand, Don offered the following description of scholarship in the humanities:

> The ultimate goal of those who devote their lives to the humanities is to contribute bits and pieces to that giant mosaic that one day may well provide us with at least a partial answer to that most significant of questions: What does it mean to be human? . . . [T]hose missing bits and pieces . . . are to be found in the works of man and specifically in the artifacts that are created by forces deep in the human mind. (Ward 1987-1988:6-7)

Both the use of metaphor and the genteel modesty here are part of the genre. Nevertheless, to be honest, we should acknowledge that contributing "bits and pieces," by itself, is not very useful. The pieces also have to be set into their appropriate positions. Mosaics do not reveal intelligible pictures if their tiles are all mixed up. Because of its history of investigation coupled with classification, the comparative approach to folklore research engenders practices of order and thoroughness that are crucial for the proper arrangement of the big picture. Once a piece has been found and dusted off, it is possible to see where it belongs, what relationship it has to nearby pieces, and where it fits in the big picture.

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

Don Ward traced his academic pedigree from Wayland Hand and Archer Taylor back through a line of Germanists to Jacob and Wilhelm Grimm (Ward 1994). In the 1950s, under the guidance of Kurt Ranke, folktale research in Germany became avidly international, and Don was one of a number of scholars from other countries who joined this endeavor. Its results are apparent in the journal *Fabula*, the *Enzyklopädie des Märchens*, and *The Types of International Folktales*, all edited in Göttingen. The world of scholarship is fortunate that for several decades the Center for Comparative Mythology and Folklore at the University of California, Los Angeles, with which both Wayland Hand and Don Ward were affiliated, provided support for and invited extra participation in this effort.

Comparative folktale scholarship owes its existence to the Grimms. It is inconceivable that it would have developed as it did without their philological influence. They can be seen as practitioners of the "bits and pieces" method. A large part of Jacob's *Deutsche Mythologie* consists of small bits of relatively recent material, analyzed and arranged so as to construct larger ideas of myth from a more distant past. They were also tenacious scholars, always wanting to add more evidence. The ever-expanding notes to the *Kinder- und Hausmärchen* (KHM) reveal their continuing interest in the underlying tradition that each of their texts represents.[1] They even collected material for a second edition of the *Deutsche Sagen*, although they never completed that project (Grimm and Grimm 1993:3).[2]

In other countries, by the middle of the nineteenth century, the comparative approach was being developed largely in studies of traditional poetry. Two different procedures developed to handle multiple versions of what was obviously a single song. One procedure was the reconstruction of a supposed original text, as in Elias Lönnrot's reconstruction of the Finnish epic, the *Kalevala*. The other technique was to find and present all important variants in as complete a form as possible, as in the definitive scholarly collections of Scandinavian and English ballads. The so-called historic-geographic method, used primarily to investigate tale types but also for other genres including ballads and riddles, with its coded variants and its close attention to each motif (Krohn 1971; Thompson 1946:430-46), is a particularly stringent form of this approach. Comparative research can also be presented in a less formalized, more colloquial manner (e.g., Taylor 1927-1928).

In the United States, the chain of comparative scholarship begins with Francis James Child's edition of English and Scottish ballads (1857-1858). His student George Lyman Kittredge completed that project and continued a similar approach into his studies of medieval and

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

early modern literature. Kittredge taught many students at Harvard University, some of whom became ballad collectors and others, literary scholars, including Stith Thompson and Archer Taylor, who approached traditional literature from an international, comparative perspective.

Academic departments of literature rely heavily on the concept of the author to organize their curricula. In particular, biographical criticism gives great importance to the author's life. In contrast to this personal orientation, the concept of traditionality deemphasizes the notion of the author as a unique individual. The person responsible for passing on a traditional story can have very little importance: if the author is unknown, the entire significance of a work can lie in the fact that it tells a certain story. Of course, many famous authors do retell traditional material, but so do nonentities and authors who prefer not to be identified. Anonymity can be a useful rhetorical ploy: the authority of tradition, supposedly age-old and incontrovertible, may carry more weight than a name of dubious significance.

The idea behind a comparative approach is that similar items gain significance by being grouped together. Replication is an essential characteristic of traditionality: something cannot be traditional if it has not been done before (Ben-Amos 1984). Numbers count. Any tradition with twenty, a hundred, or a thousand exemplars is obviously an important one. The parameters by which such groupings are formed become the basis of classification. A biological metaphor has been used (Hafstein 2001): the items are like members of a single species, and, having defined the species, we can better understand the consistency and variety of its manifestations. This analogy makes the type relatively concrete. It works best when the exemplars are quite similar in their structure and details. Alternatively, the postulated relationship among variants of a type can be abstract: the type is a Platonic form that lurks in the background but never quite reveals itself. This model is usually invoked when there is more variety in the details of the exemplars. The choice between these two models is partly a matter of the researcher's temperament. In many cases, however, the condition of the material analyzed dictates which model is more helpful. A single study may invoke both models, as did Swahn's work on The Search for the Lost Husband (ATU 425). After creating a series of alternative archetypes for the second part of the story, he insisted that the tale originally had no identifiable archetype, only a theme (Swahn 1955:418).

Modeled as it was on philological text reconstruction and biological classification, the comparative approach to folklore was intended to

This content downloaded from
79.110f:ffff:ffff:ffff:ffff on Thu, 01 Jan 1976 12:34:56 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

reveal groups and hierarchies that were empirically valid. Nowadays, most people do not believe that a comparative study has any power of "scientific correctness." But, in the practice of literary analysis, there are degrees of objectivity, as well as degrees of subjectivity. One of the strengths of a comparative approach is that it trains its practitioners to depend, at least at the beginning of a research project, on relatively objective criteria.

To show the different ways in which a comparative study can be valuable, I have made a list of twelve points:

1) Contrary to what the term "historic-geographic" implies, the primary utility of a comparative study is to *reveal the form* that is manifested in (or behind) the real examples that are adduced. Some researchers, the minimalists, prefer the shortest form possible, the "kernel." If any part of this kernel is missing, the example does not really belong to the group, but to some more general layer of tradition. Other researchers like to construct the longest, most detailed form possible, and expect that many examples will be incomplete.

In defense against the perennial accusation that constructing a form is reductionist, I would say that it is no more reductionist than most other types of analysis. Tradition, and particularly oral tradition, is notably various; different narrators elaborate or alter a tale in interesting but incompatible ways. My own reaction has repeatedly been that no reconstructed form can do justice to the fascinating variation that the folktale texts exhibit. In order to discuss this situation, however, order must be introduced. After a comparative analysis, it is easy to go back and forth between the abstract form and the rich evidence. Treated this way, the form actually helps to show how varied the evidence is. Once the sameness has been properly defined, differences become easier to appreciate. In particular, the researcher can assess degrees of difference and arrange the material accordingly.

2) The construction of a form is useful to suggest *solutions for problematic details or incomplete texts.* For example, a seemingly decorative motif can turn out to be a piece of a traditional episode. In the Grimms' tale of Hänsel and Gretel (KHM 15), the children kill the witch and then, taking her treasure, head for home. On the way, they meet a duck that carries them across a river. This duck is a remnant of a Magic Flight episode found in other variants of the same tale type (ATU 327A), in which one witch is killed but another witch remains to pursue the children through obstacles and eventually across a lake, where the witch either drowns or bursts from trying to drink it dry (Goldberg 2000). Another

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

example is Geoffrey Chaucer's Friar's Tale, which is unusual in the *Canterbury Tales*—it has even been said that Chaucer used characterization and humor to compensate for a poorly developed story. As Archer Taylor (1921; also in Bryan and Dempster 1941:269-74) and, later, Lutz Röhrich (1967, 2:251-78, 460-71), have demonstrated, other versions of this tale type, The Devil and the Advocate (ATU 1186), use repetition and intensification to give the tale a much sharper point.

3) Another useful result of determining the form of a tale type is that *material that does not belong to the type can be separated out.* This is how tale types are defined. For example, the tales of Cinderella and the woman who hides inside the skin of a donkey or other covering have long been lumped together (ATU 510 A and B), although all that they share is a sequence of scenes in which an ill-treated heroine is seen without her ugly disguise at a ball. People may like to conflate these tales because between them they offer an interesting range of female experience. But close attention to the similarities and differences in their motifs always shows that they are separate tale types (Goldberg 1997a).

Similarly, there is an Asian tale about children who are visited by a man-eating tiger disguised as their aunt. Although this tale shares motifs with both Little Red Riding Hood (ATU 333) and The Wolf and the Kids (ATU 123), these are actually three separate tale types (Delarue and Tenèze 2002, 1:381-83 [no. 333]). There is of course a level on which they are similar: humans let a man-eater into their house. But tale types are defined on a level of more specific details than this.

4) Historic-geographic studies, in particular, are good at *identifying and organizing the subtypes of a tale.* Warren Roberts' study (1958) of The Kind and the Unkind Girls (ATU 480) identified two major subtypes, one with several forms, and then other groups and forms for particular regions or with unusual motifs. He traced the development of the tale from the Near East into Europe along a number of different routes. Swahn (1955) found that four ATU 425 subtypes were evident for the latter part of the tale. Humorous tales, on the other hand, are less subject to local intrusions from folk belief, but regional differences may still develop. Brunvand's study (1991) of the Taming of the Shrew (ATU 901) aligned Shakespeare's play with a form of the tale from northern Europe.

5) Once the form of a tale has been defined, it is possible to *investigate the composition* of both this abstract form and the more concrete variants that were used in the study. Many types of magic tales, including, for example, The Three Oranges (ATU 408), Snow White (ATU 709), and The Three Golden Children (ATU 707), have two or more fairly

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

balanced parts.[3] Such a sequence permits a theme to be developed and then reinforced by repetition. In addition, motifs or images in one part of the tale are often enhanced by their reflections in another part.

Many of these two-part tales coexist with a short form that includes only one of the parts. For example, in The Princess Who Can Not Solve the Riddle (ATU 851), there are usually two riddle contests. In the second, the riddle refers to the princess herself, who sneaked into the hero's room during the night. But one form of the tale, popular in southern Europe, ends after only one riddle contest. The international tale type The Three Snake Leaves (ATU 612) tells of a faithless wife and how her husband takes revenge on her. But many other accounts are shorter legends that employ the core motif, in which a certain character learns to use, and then uses, a certain herb to revive the dead. The Ungrateful Serpent Returned to Captivity (ATU 155) is a third example: one strand of the tradition is a brief fable that ends with the death of the rescuer, while in another strand, a third character tricks the snake back into the trap.

6) Looking back from the abstract form to the variants that produced it shows *which details are preserved and which ones are easily subject to change.* Domestic animals may be interchangeable, as in some strands of The Devil and the Advocate (see above). In other cases, they are more fixed. In the tale type Mak and the Sheep (ATU 1525M), when a stolen animal is hidden in a cradle or bed, disguised as a sick person, it is usually a sheep. When the animal is propped up in the outhouse or transported in a car, it is more often a hog. At the end of The Rich and the Poor Farmer (ATU 1535), the trickster claims to have found either a horse or a herd of sheep or cattle at the bottom of the river. The choice of animal appears to depend on the common circumstances of everyday life, which produce geographical patterns. However, this choice produces no significant alteration in the course of the tale.

Supernatural beings are also in some cases standardized and in others interchangeable. In The Three Oranges (ATU 408), during his journey the hero may or may not meet guides who direct him on his way. These guides are variously cosmic beings, ogres, old people, and the like. Geography apparently has some effect on their nature: some are confined to certain regions. Nevertheless, this is an unstable motif, and similar variations exist in other tales, including ATU 425 and ATU 480 (Goldberg 1997b: 123-39). In the tale of The Monster Bridegroom, the nature of the husband is partly attributable to geography and partly to the different subtypes of the tale. Underneath this explainable level

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

of variation, there are inexplicable occurrences of unique details, which must be credited to individual narrators rather than to tradition (Swahn 1955:227-33).

7) A comparative study identifies how a tale type changes, including its *changes in time, in space, and in genre.* Frequently a complex form is identified that applies to modern (or, specifically, modern European) material, while only parts of this form are found earlier, or outside of Europe. Jan de Vries remarked on this phenomenon in his study of The Clever Peasant Girl (ATU 875; Vries 1928:406-427). It is also true of The Prince as Bird (ATU 432): the earliest known version, that in the twelfth-century Marie de France's Lay of Yonec, tells of the bird's visit to his lover and his injury at the hands of a jealous woman, without the latter part of the tale in which the heroine searches for and cures the bird prince. Part of this phenomenon of modern European complexity may be due to editing practices. Editors of modern European tales tend to prefer what they believe to be complete forms. Old writers like Marie were free to do as they pleased. Collectors who work outside of Europe often publish accurate texts even when they are not as complete as they might be.

Max Lüthi (1959, 1961) discussed several centuries of the history of The Maiden in the Tower (ATU 310), including versions from Basile and Mme de la Force and the Grimms's tale, Rapunzel, and showed that these published versions have influenced the oral tradition of the tale in Europe. However, around the Mediteranean and in Arab tradition more generally, the kernel episode of this tale type, the maiden who admits a lover to the tower in which she is imprisoned, occurs in a different narrative setting. The beginning of the tale often features the prince's longing for the imprisoned woman (instead of the pregnant mother's desire for a salad). After they meet in the tower, the lovers escape by means of a Magic Flight (as in Basile's tale of Petrosinella). Then, the prince often leaves his bride and forgets all about her (El-Shamy 1980, no. 8; Goldberg 1997b:204-213; cf. ATU 313).

ATU 310 is one of many tale types or folktale cycles (a "tale cycle" understood as a group of types that share important motifs or episodes) for which the European tradition is apparently an offshoot of a more variable tradition found in Africa, the Middle East, or India. Cinderella (ATU 510A) is another, as is The Children and the Ogre (ATU 327 with its subtypes), including Hänsel and Gretel and The Dwarf and the Giant (Perrault's Le Petit Poucet).

8) What produces the continuity that convinces us that a tradition exists? This is a persistent question. A hundred years ago, British

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

scholars favored independent invention of similar details, while continental scholars envisioned dissemination of larger units, mainly tale types. However, sizeable components of tale types—whole scenes, for example—often exist outside those tale types, in other types (Goldberg 1997b:214-38; 1998; 2004), or even in other genres. These prefabricated components can have their own set of traditional details that exists both within and outside any particular tale type. That suggests an intermediate stage between the independent invention of all the details of the tale and a so-called genetic relationship between whole tales. This intermediate stage would consist of repeated assembly from prefabricated parts.

A historic-geographic study lays out the tale's distribution in time and space. It is essential to know this, before continuity can be discussed. For example, the Tar Baby motif is at the center of a tale type (ATU 175) that is extremely popular in Africa. A thief steals secretly (usually, fruit from a garden), and the tar baby is erected as a lure to catch this thief. Interestingly, there are several early Indian versions of the sticky doll motif, but only in one of them is a *thief* trapped by the sticky figure. In the others, and in the few European variants, a hero uses a sticky figure to catch an adversary or a demon (Espinosa 1930).

9) When a researcher is interested in a particular text of a traditional tale, an organized presentation of other versions *provides a background for judging that particular variant.* Many scholars have studied source material, sometimes even including later analogs, for major authors such as Chaucer and Shakespeare. In addition to the question of possible sources used by a famous author or in a famous work, a comparative analysis also suggests alternative artistic possibilities. It shows what other narrative strategies are possible for that story, so we can see examples of what the famous author might have done with the tale, but didn't.

Much light can be thrown on the Grimms' tales in this manner. Seeing these against the background of other versions of the same tale type often shows how they have been altered, either by informants or by the Grimms themselves. For example, in the Bear's Son motif complex (EM, s.v. *Bärensohn*, an entry by Donald Ward), there is usually some implication that the boy's mother became the bear's wife. However, in the Grimms' text (KHM 166), human robbers take the place of the bear. The figure of Gretel's duck, mentioned above, is relevant here too, as is the tale of Rapunzel.

The Fisherman and his Wife (ATU 555) is a peculiar tale. The wish-granting fish makes us anticipate a magic tale; often, such a fish grants children to a childless couple. But in other respects the tale does not

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

fulfill our expectations for that genre. The tale has no heroic hero, no quest, no overcoming an adversary, no happy end. Other versions of this tale type demonstrate that the middle-aged married couple and the unhappy ending belong to moralistic religious tales like The Three Wishes (ATU 750A). Still other versions tend toward comical formula tales, with the old people living in a vinegar bottle or a pisspot, and much being made of the gradual intensification of the woman's excessive demands.

The Shoemaker and the Elves (KHM 39.1) is another tale that has slipped between the genres. In terms used by the Grimms, it is a *Sage* reworked into a *Märchen.* A search for analogs leads to supernatural beliefs and legends of helpful domestic spirits who usually assist with housework or with farm work such as threshing (EM, s.v. *Kobold*). These include examples from the Grimms' own *Deutsche Sagen* (nos. 72-74).[4]

10) Then, there is *reception.* What has been the influence of literary texts? Which forms of a tale type are most popular, and why? Every retelling, every performance, is an interpretation, an opportunity to revise the tale. What drives narrators, in various regions and time periods, to relate tales from direct or indirect foreign sources? The Grimms were sensitive to the possibility of literary sources. They removed tales from subsequent editions of their *Kinder und Hausmärchen* when they felt that those tales were too closely derived from such authors as Charles Perrault ("Puss in Boots" and "Bluebeard") and Mme D'Aulnoy ("Okerlo," a retelling of The Bee and the Orange Tree). But they retained "Rotkäppchen" (Little Red Riding Hood) in spite of its similarity to Perrault's "Le Petit Chaperon Rouge."

The more recent phenomenon of the reception of tales popularized by nineteenth-century printed sources is obviously extensive (cf. Haase 1993). As time passes, more and more tale types from Perrault and the *Kinder und Hausmärchen* are collected in places such as Africa and China, well outside the region for which *The Types of the Folktale* was designed. To take another example, Jack and the Beanstalk used to be endemic to British and Anglo-American tradition; now it is also collected in other lands (ATU 328A).

Such developments are neither rare nor new: many instances of folktale diffusion via written sources are also known from earlier centuries. More than a century before "reception" became a fashionable concept in literary study, comparative folktale researchers were investigating some of the facets of this idea. Such work has appeared in folktale monographs (see Goldberg 1984) and also in books with numerous

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

examples (e.g. Cosquin 1886, Clouston 1887). Whether they located a tale's place of origin in Asia or in Europe, these scholars paid attention to how the narrative had been copied or altered in different times and places. In addition to identifying details that were omitted, altered, or elaborated, such studies furnish information about more general qualities pertaining to the aesthetics especially of European folk narrative.

On a smaller scale, the coded summaries and discursive comments in the French catalog of Delarue and Ténèze (2002) show how literary tales in France have been adopted or adapted by oral narrators there. Delarue obviously took pride in noting episodes in modern oral tradition that were not part of the earlier literary texts.

11) Comparative folktale research is *cumulative.* Because they share a common understanding of what tale types and motifs are, later researchers can depend on the work of earlier ones. If they know of new or contradictory evidence, they can disagree on an empirical basis. While in the short term such disagreement may seem counterproductive, in the long term it turns out to be a good thing. Different opinions can be weighed according to the evidence, not just their visceral appeal. Historic-geographic studies are famous for their ability to analyze hundreds of variants. This is helpful, but smaller studies that showcase a tale's variation in a limited region or an important time period can also be valuable.

12) Because of this power of accumulation, comparative folklore scholarship engenders *bibliographic expertise.* One instance of a motif or a tale is amplified by other instances of the same thing, and then this body of material can be related to examples that are either more general or more specific. All this is organized systematically. This system has permitted indexes to be written that facilitate access to vast amounts of material. This is a very useful form of scholarly cooperation. The latest revision of *The Types of the Folktale,* now called *The Types of International Folktales* (Uther 2004), utilized some 3000 reference books and articles. These are primarily regional type and motif indexes and studies of one or more types or motifs. Such easy access is hardly short of marvelous.

The *Motif Index* (Thompson 1955-1958) is useful for identifying and tracing the components of tales. The mindset it produces, which enables a researcher to understand how motifs are formed into tales, is invaluable. However, its references are fifty years old, so researchers need to supplement them vigorously. Moreover, several literary traditions that undoubtedly had an important influence on European folktales were never properly covered. One of these overlooked traditions is the

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

biblical, with its supernatural motifs such as God in different forms speaking to humans; fairy tale motifs, such as the successful youngest son, and Jephtha's daughter; and motifs from Bible-based proverbs like the two roads in Little Red Riding Hood, which echo the broad and narrow ways in Matthew 7:13-14.

Nor does the *Motif Index* include good references for motifs from classical mythology, long a mainstay of literate European culture. William Hansen's recent book, *Ariadne's Thread,* includes tale types current in ancient Greece and Rome, and H. J. Rose's *Handbook* has a section on Märchen in Greece and Rome. Fortunately, once one determines the name(s) of the character(s) with whom a particular motif is associated, classical dictionaries can be used efficiently to locate primary sources.

A third genre that is underrepresented in the *Motif Index* is literary fairy tales. Most of those that correspond to recognized tale types can be found by means of Bolte and Polívka's commentary on KHM (1913-1932, vol. 4), and Delarue and Ténèze's *Le Conte populaire française* (2002). This genre is an important source for modern oral tradition (Bottigheimer 2003). However, there is no easy way to find a particular motif in one of these tales when it occurs in an unexpected plot. For example, Mme D'Aulnoy's tale "Finette Cendron," a combination of ATU 327A and ATU 510A, also includes a false beauty doctor motif (motif K1013; EM, s.v. *Schönheitskur*).

To review the twelve points, comparative folktale research is good for: determining the form of a tale or motif; reconstructing incomplete texts; distinguishing between separate tale types; organizing subtypes; determining how a tale was composed; and determining which details are important. With regard to a tale's stability and variation, it is commendable for tracing changes through time and space; discussing continuity; providing background for appreciating a particular text; and tracking material necessary for the study of a tale's reception. With regard to scholarship, it encourages cumulative scholarly progress and provides a conceptual basis for essential indexes. It is unfortunate that graduate students in literature and folklore are not more aware of the advantages of this kind of research.

Where can a reader find examples of comparative folktale scholarship? If the locus of interest is a particular tale type, both *The Types of the Folktale* and *The Types of International Folktales* indicate such studies before the list of citations of variants and catalogs. The tale type articles in the *Enzyklopädie des Märchens* (see note 3) are themselves compact comparative studies and provide references to relevant longer works.

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

If a reader's interest lies more in the technique or in general results than in a particular story, many important historic-geographic studies are listed in Goldberg 1984, and others have been cited in the present article. In addition, Gerould's study of The Grateful Dead (Gerould 1908) and Jones's of Snow White (Jones 1990) should also be mentioned. These are more discursive than other studies that use the typical, codified historic-geographic format. *Popular Tales and Fictions* (Clouston 1887) and *African Folktales in the New World* (Bascom 1992) are two books that intend to demonstrate certain routes of folktale migration. Clouston specialized in European tales that he could trace to eastern sources, and Bascom specialized in American tales that could be traced to Africa.

Collections of folktales are sometimes published with notes that provide a comparative perspective for each text in the collection. A note may explain how this text is unusual, or how it agrees with its national tradition, or how the national tradition of this tale type follows or diverges from the type's international tradition. The most thorough of these collections is Emmanuel Cosquin's tales from Lorraine (1886), where many of the comparative notes, which give detailed summaries of many variants, are even longer than the texts they discuss. The tales (collected not by only Cosquin but also by his sisters and another local woman) are indeed, as it says on the title page, "compared with tales from other French provinces and from foreign countries." Herbert Halpert discussed international parallels for *The Folktales of Newfoundland* (Halpert and Widdowson 1996). Richard Dorson's "The Folktales of the World" series (1963-1980, including El-Shamy 1980) insisted on the standardized format of a comparative note for each tale.

Stith Thompson wrote that only after we have traced the life histories of each individual tale type can we write the history of the folktale as a whole (1946:447). Even if ultimately this was an impractical position, much has been learned along the way. Thompson also insisted that because folktales are international, folktale research has to be international too. This need not mean that each folktale study has to be international, only that its author and readers be aware of the place of the tale in international tradition.

NOTES

1. Only one version of these notes is available in English, in Grimm and Grimm 1884.

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

2. See also Grimm and Grimm 1981, updated by Ward's commentary (1:315-432; 2:239-311).
3. For tale types without references, see the corresponding entries in Uther 2004 (ATU) and in EM, s.v. *Erzähltypen*, which gives the title for each tale type number).
4. Too often, the Grimms' folktales are taken as standard, even when large numbers of variants weigh against this assumption. But it is also true that interest in the Grimms' tales has motivated a great amount of folktale scholarship.

WORKS CITED

Bascom, William. 1992. *African Folktales in the New World.* Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Ben-Amos, Dan. 1980. The Concept of Motif in Folklore. In *Folklore Studies in the Twentieth Century*, ed. Venetia J. Newall. Woodbridge, Suffolk: D. S. Brewer; Totowa, N. J.: Rowman and Littlefield 17-36.

———. 1984. The Seven Strands of Tradition: Varieties of its Meaning in American Folklore Studies. *Journal of Folklore Research* 21:97-131.

Bolte, Johannes, and Georg Polívka. 1913-1932. *Anmerkungen zu den Kinder- und Hausmärchen der Brüder Grimm.* 5 vols. Leipzig: Diederich.

Bottigheimer, Ruth. 2003. The Ultimate Fairy Tale: Oral Transmission in a Literate World. In *A Companion to the Fairy Tale,* ed. Hilda Ellis Davidson and Anna Chaudhri. Cambridge, England: D. Brewer 57-70.

Brunvand, Jan Harold. 1991. *The Taming of the Shrew; a Comparative Study of Oral and Literary Versions.* New York: Garland.

Bryan, W. F., and Germaine Dempster, eds. 1941. *Sources and Analogues of Chaucer's Canterbury Tales.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Clouston, William A. 1887. *Popular Tales and Fictions, their Migrations and Transformations.* 2 vols. Edinburgh and London: W. Blackwood and Sons.

Cosquin, Emmanuel. 1886. *Contes populaires de Lorraine.* 2 vols. Paris: F. Vieweg.

Delarue, Paul, and Marie-Louise Ténèze. 2002. *Le Conte populaire française.* 4 vols. in one. Paris: Maisonneuve et Larose.

El-Shamy, Hasan. 1980. *Folktales of Egypt.* Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.

Enzyklopädie des Märchens, ed. K. Ranke et al. 1977. Berlin: W. de Gruyter.

Espinosa, Aurelio. M. 1930. Notes on the Origin and History of the Tar-Baby Story. *Journal of American Folklore* 43:129-209

Gerould, Gordon Hall. 1908. *The Grateful Dead, the History of a Folk Story.* London: D. Nutt.

Goldberg, Christine. 1984. The Historic-Geographic Method: Past and Future. *Journal of Folklore Research* 21:1-18.

———. 1997a. The Donkey Skin Folktale Cycle (AT 510B). *Journal of American Folklore* 110:28-46.

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

———. 1997b. *The Tale of the Three Oranges.* Folklore Fellows Communications 263. Helsinki: Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia.

———. 1998. Some Suggestions for Future Folktale Indexes. In *Die heutige Bedeutung oraler Traditionen / The Present-Day Significance of Oral Traditions,* ed. Walther Heissig and Rüdiger Schott. Opladen/Wiesbaden: Westdeutscher Verlag 249-62.

———. 2000. Gretel's Duck: The Escape from the Ogre in AaTh 327. *Fabula* 41:42-51.

———. 2004. At the Ogre's House. *Folklore* 115:309-320.

Grimm, Jacob and Wilhelm. 1884. *Grimms Household Tales,* with the authors' notes, trans. Margaret Hunt, with an introduction by Andrew Lang. 2 vols. London: G. Bell and Sons.

———. 1981. *The German Legends of the Brothers Grimm,* trans. Donald Ward. 2 vols. Philadelphia and London: Institute for the Study of Human Issues.

———. 1993. *Deutsche Sagen.* 3 vols. Vols. 1-2, ed. Hans-Jörg Uther; vol 3, ed. Barbara Kindermann-Bieri. München: Diederichs.

Haase, Donald, ed. 1993. *The Reception of Grimm's Fairy Tales: Responses, Reactions, Revisions.* Detroit: Wayne State University Press.

Hafstein, Valdimar. 2001. Biological Metaphors in Folklore Scholarship: An Essay in the History of Ideas. *Arv* 57:7-32.

Halpert, Herbert, and J. D. A. Widdowson. 1996. *Folktales of Newfoundland.* 2 vols. New York and London: Garland Publishing.

Hansen, William F. 2002. *Ariadne's Thread.* Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press.

Jones, Steven Swann. 1990. *The New Comparative Method: Structure and Symbolic Analysis of the Allomotifs of "Snow White."* Folklore Fellows Communications 247. Helsinki: Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia.

Krohn, Kaarle. 1971. *Folklore Methodology.* Austin: University of Texas Press.

Lüthi, Max. 1959. Die Herkunft des Grimmschen Rapunzelmärchens. *Fabula* 3:96-118.

———. 1961. *Volksmärchen und Volkssage.* Bern and München: Francke.

Mieder, Wolfgang. 2005. Donald J. Ward (1930-2004). *Fabula* 46:142-44.

Roberts, Warren E. 1958. *The Tale of the Kind and Unkind Girls.* Berlin: De Gruyter.

Röhrich, Lutz. 1962, 1967. *Erzählungen des späten Mittelalters.* 2 vols. Bern: C. Franke.

Rose, H. J. 1959. *A Handbook of Greek Mythology.* New York: E. P. Dutton & Co.

Swahn, J. Ö. 1955. *The Tale of Cupid and Psyche.* Lund: C. W. K. Gleerup.

Taylor, Archer. 1921. The Devil and the Advocate. *PMLA* 36:35-59.

———. 1927-1928. Precursors of the Finnish Method of Folklore Study. *Modern Philology* 25:481-91.

Thompson, Stith. 1946. *The Folktale.* New York: Dryden.

———. 1955. *Narrative Motif-Analysis as a Folklore Method.* Folklore Fellows Communications 161. Helsinki: Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia.

———. 1955-1958. *The Motif-Index of Folk Literature.* 2nd ed. Bloomington: Indiana University Press (abbreviated mot.).

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms

Uther, Hans-Jörg. 2004. *The Types of International Folktales.* 3 vols. Folklore Fellows Communications 284-86. Helsinki: Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia.

Vries, Jan de. 1928. *Die Märchen von klugen Rätsellösern.* Folklore Fellows Communications 73. Helsinki: Suomalainen Tiedeakatemia.

Ward, Donald. 1972. The Fiddler and the Beast: Modern Evidence of an Ancient Theme. *Fabula* 13:108-121.

———. 1987-1988. Main Eulogy from the UCLA Memorial Service for Wayland D. Hand. *Folklore and Mythology Studies* 11-12:5-7.

———. 1989. 'Beauty and the Beast': Fact and Fancy, Past and Present. *Midwestern Folklore* 15:119-25.

———. 1994. The German Connection: The Brothers Grimm and the Study of Oral Literature. *Western Folklore* 53:1-26.

This content downloaded from
79.110.128.145 on Tue, 28 Sep 2021 07:24:57 UTC
All use subject to https://about.jstor.org/terms